

Date of meeting:	08 August 2025
Title of Report:	Mount Edgcumbe Fire Damage Refurbishment - Options Appraisal
Lead Member:	Councillor Jemima Laing (Deputy Leader, and Cabinet Member for Children's Social Care, Culture and Communications)
Lead Strategic Director:	Glenn Caplin-Grey (Strategic Director for Growth) Vicky Fraser (Service Director for Environment & Connectivity)
Author:	Tamsin Daniel (Protected & Historic Landscapes Manager)
Contact Email:	Tamsin.Daniel@cornwall.gov.uk
Your Reference:	N/A
Key Decision:	No
Confidentiality:	Part I - Official

Purpose of Report

This report is being brought to Mount Edgcumbe Joint Committee to seek endorsement for the recommendation that the Grade II Listed Barrow Centre is sympathetically restored following the fire in February 2025 and that the restoration also takes account of the necessary regulatory upgrades to afford compliance with current Building Regulations.

Recommendations and Reasons

1. The Mount Edgcumbe Joint Committee endorse the recommendation to proceed with the preferred refurbishment option: to sympathetically restore the fire damaged areas of the Grade II Listed Barrow Centre and that the restoration takes account of the necessary regulatory upgrades for afford compliance with current Building Regulations.

Reason: The Options Appraisal undertaken by Arcadis considered four scenarios for the reinstatement of the fire-damaged building. These included:

1. *Like for like restoration.*
2. *Restoration to bring the property up to current Building Regulations (within the scope of the insurance claim).*
3. *An enhanced option considering greater income for MECP through business and residential alterations.*
4. *An enhanced option considering net zero emissions / decarbonisation.*

The report concludes that Option 1 is not feasible on the grounds of essential compliance upgrades. The remaining options are individually feasible. However, the recommendation is to proceed with a blend of these remaining options within the scope of the insurance claim; essentially Option 2, with consideration for improving the accommodation and reducing the carbon footprint as can be achieved within the scope of the insurance claim and the 2-year period allowed by the insurance company for completing the restoration.

In consideration of Option 3: this recommendation also assumes the continuation of the existing accommodation block uses, though coupled with the reconfiguration of the accommodation to provide more efficient floor plans. It is again assumed that the cost associated with achieving this will be comparable to that which will be incurred for the recommendations outlined above. For example, with internal walls having to be replaced due to the damage, alternative layouts could be proposed that are similar in overall quantity with even an opportunity for savings if layouts are simplified. Any reconfiguration of internal spaces will need to be part of the Listed Building Consent considerations.

In consideration of Option 4: this recommendation will take into account the opportunity for energy efficiency improvements as identified within the Decarbonisation Plan for Mount Edgcumbe Country Park, within the scope of the insurance claim and Listed Building Consent. We anticipate that the necessary costs in achieving this are comparable to that which may be incurred for regulatory compliance upgrades, while also designing in flexibility for future proofing. More extensive targets that would work towards reducing carbon emissions however, when evaluated for the Barrow Centre accommodation block in isolation, would be overly ambitious and costly, and likely to delay progress with the restoration of the building given the need for Listed Building Consent and the 2-year period set by the insurance company for the restoration of the property.

Alternative options considered and rejected

- I. Alternative options considered and rejected: 'like for like' restoration has been rejected as it is a requirement that the restoration of the property complies with current Building Regulations.

Relevance to the Corporate Plan and/or the Plymouth Plan

- Spending Money Wisely
- Providing Quality Public Services

Implications for the Medium Term Financial Plan and Resource Implications:

The restoration of the fire-damaged Barrow Centre will predominantly be financed through an insurance claim in the region of £1.642 million, inclusive of VAT and the £50,000 contribution from both Plymouth City Council and Cornwall Council (£100,000 insurance 'excess').

Financial Risks

There is the financial risk to both councils that the insurance claim will not meet the full costs of the fire-damaged areas of the property being restored and brought up to current Building Regulations.

This risk has been considered and mitigations set out in the report.

Legal Implications

(Provided by AC)

This report is an endorsement of the proposed way forward which will need to be approved by each of the Councils in line with their standard governance requirements for capital projects.

Carbon Footprint (Environmental) Implications:

The restoration of the fire-damaged areas of the Barrow Centre will include upgrading to current Building Regulations and where possible within the scope of the insurance claim, reducing the carbon footprint of the capital works and future operation.

Other Implications: e.g. Health and Safety, Risk Management, Child Poverty:

** When considering these proposals members have a responsibility to ensure they give due regard to the Council's duty to promote equality of opportunity, eliminate unlawful discrimination and promote good relations between people who share protected characteristics under the Equalities Act and those who do not.*

Bailey Partnership is appointed by Arcadis, on behalf of Cornwall Council via the Built Environment Professional Services 2 (BEPs2) Framework. The basis of Bailey Partnership's appointment is to provide multidisciplinary consultancy services for the fire refurbishment project at MECP Barrow Centre following the damage sustained to the accommodation block by a fire on the 4 February 2025. The Terms of Bailey Partnership appointment space RIBA Stages 1 through 7 and includes design, statutory planning processes, procurement and project management of the refurbishment works, as well as acting as Principal Designer. The role of Principal Designer is to plan, manage, monitor and coordinate safety in the pre-construction phase and throughout the project.

Appendices

**Add rows as required to box below*

Ref.	Title of Appendix	Exemption Paragraph Number (if applicable) <i>If some/all of the information is confidential, you must indicate why it is not for publication by virtue of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 by ticking the relevant box.</i>						
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7
A	Fire Damage Refurbishment – Options Appraisal (Bailey Partnership)							
B	Refurbishment Project Mandate							
C	Refurbishment Briefing Note							

Background papers:

**Add rows as required to box below*

Please list all unpublished, background papers relevant to the decision in the table below. Background papers are unpublished works, relied on to a material extent in preparing the report, which disclose facts or matters on which the report or an important part of the work is based.

Title of any background paper(s)	Exemption Paragraph Number (if applicable)						
	If some/all of the information is confidential, you must indicate why it is not for publication by virtue of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 by ticking the relevant box.						
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7

Sign off:

Fin	ITG.2 5.26.0 49	Leg	LS/0 0001 966/ 2/AC /31/7 /25	Mon Off	N/A	HR	N/A	Assets	N/A	Strat Proc	N/A
Originating Senior Leadership Team member: David Draffan											

Please confirm the Strategic Director(s) has agreed the report? Yes

Date agreed: 31/07/2025

Cabinet Member approval: *Councillor Jemima Laing (Cabinet Member for Children's Social Care, Culture and Communications)*

Date approved: 31/07/2025